	Case 2:12-cv-04261-AJW Document 1	Filed 05/16/12 Page 1 of 13 Page ID #:14
1	4	FILED
2		
3		2012 MAY 16 PM 12: 51
4		CHARLET COURT CHARLAL DIST. OF CALIF. Land Governor
5		
6		
7		
8	Amy L. Bennecoff (275805)	
9	Kimmel & Silverman, P.C.	
10	30 East Butler Pike Ambler, PA 19002	
11	Telephone: 215-540-8888	
12	Facsimile: 877-788-2864 abennecoff@creditlaw.com	
13	Attorney for Plaintiff	
14		
15		S DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
16	TOR THE CENTRAL D	
17	ANGELA JOHNSON,	3 Cost 102 - 4261-PSO (AJUX)
18	Plaintiff,) COMPLAINT FOR DAMAGES) 1. VIOLATION OF THE FAIR
19	V.	DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT, 15 U.S.C. §1692 ET. SEQ.;
20	PORTFOLIO RECOVERY ASSOCIATES, LLC,	2. VIOLATION OF THE ROSENTHAL FAIR DEBT
21		OCLLECTION PRACTICES ACT, CAL. CIV. CODE §1788 ET. SEQ.
22	Defendant.	JURY TRIAL DEMANDED
23		_)
24		
25		4
26		
27		

COMPLAINT

ANGELA JOHNSON ("Plaintiff"), by her attorneys, KIMMEL & SILVERMAN, P.C., alleges the following against Defendant PORTFOLIO RECOVERY ASSOCIATES, LLC. ("Defendant"):

INTRODUCTION

1. Plaintiff's Complaint is based on the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, 15 U.S.C. §1692 *et seq.* ("FDCPA") and the Rosenthal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act, cal. Civ. Code §1788, *et. seq.* ("RFDCPA") which prohibits debt collectors from engaging in abusive, deceptive, and unfair practices.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 2. Jurisdiction of this court arises pursuant to 15 U.S.C. § 1692k(d), which states that such actions may be brought and heard before "any appropriate United States district court without regard to the amount in controversy," and 28 U.S.C. § 1331 grants this court original jurisdiction of all civil actions arising under the laws of the United States.
- 3. Defendant conducts business in the State of California and therefore, personal jurisdiction is established.
 - 4. Venue is proper pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b)(2).

PARTIES

- 5. Plaintiff is a natural person residing in Ventura, California.
- 6. Plaintiff is a "consumer" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(3) and is a "debtor" as defined by Cal. Civ. Code §1788.2(h).
- 7. Defendant is a corporation specializing in debt collection with its principal place of business located at 120 Corporate Boulevard, Norfolk, Virginia 23502
- 8. Defendant is a "debt collector" as that term is defined by 15 U.S.C. §1692a(6), and RFDCPA, Cal. Civ. Code §1788.2(c).
- 9. Defendant acted through its agents, employees, officers, members, directors, heirs, successors, assigns, principals, trustees, sureties, subrogees, representatives, and insurers.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 10. At all relevant times, Defendant was acting to collect an alleged consumer debt from Plaintiff as the term is defined by the FDCPA at 15 U.S.C. § 1692a(5) and the RFDCPA at Cal. Civ. Code §1788.2(f).
- 11. The alleged debt at issue originates from a Sears credit card that was more than twelve years old, and arose out of transactions which were primarily for personal, family, or household purposes.
 - 12. As Plaintiff owes no business debt, the debt sought by Defendant

3

5

7

6

8

10

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

2021

2223

2425

26

2728

13. Throughout the past year, and continuing until April 2012,

Defendant's collectors made repeated harassing calls to Plaintiff's home telephone

regarding the alleged Sears card debt.

could only have been personal in nature.

14. Defendant's telephone calls originated from numbers including, but

not limited to (866) 909-0529. The undersigned has confirmed that this number

belongs to Defendant.

15. Often times, Defendant's collectors placed more than three harassing

collection calls to Plaintiff in a day.

16. On several days, Defendant called Plaintiff more than five times

17. Defendant called Plaintiff well in excess of twenty-five times per

month.

18. Defendant regularly called Plaintiff back immediately after Plaintiff

hung up.

19. On several occasions, Defendant's collectors spoke with Plaintiff's

mother in law and stated that Defendant needed to speak with Plaintiff regarding

an "important personal matter."

20. This statement was a misrepresentation, as an alleged twelve year old

debt that has been purchased by a debt-buyer, could in no way be considered

"important" to Plaintiff or her mother-in-law.

21. Additionally, this conversation caused Plaintiff to discuss her

financial difficulties with her mother-in-law, which was embarrassing for Plaintiff.

- 22. Plaintiff's husband and Plaintiff's mother-in-law told Defendant on numerous occasions to stop calling their home telephone.
- 23. Despite this clear demand, Defendant continued to call Plaintiff's home telephone multiple times per day.
- 24. Defendant's actions as described herein were made with the intent to harass, abuse, and coerce payment from Plaintiff.

COUNT I DEFENDANT VIOLATED § 1692d OF THE FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

- 25. Section 1692d of the FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from engaging in any conduct the natural consequence of which is to harass, oppress or abuse any person in connection with the collection of a debt.
- 26. Defendant violated § 1692d of the FDCPA when it called Plaintiff repeatedly and continuously and when it engaged in other harassing and abusive conduct.

COUNT II DEFENDANT VIOLATED § 1692d(5) OF THE FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

27. Section 1692d(5) of the FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from

5

7

9

10 11

12

13 14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22 23

24 25

26

27

28

causing a telephone to ring or engaging any person in telephone conversation repeatedly or continuously with the intent to annoy, abuse or harass any person at the called number.

28. Defendant violated § 1692d(5) of the FDCPA when it caused Plaintiff's telephone to ring repeatedly and continuously with the intent to harass or annoy Plaintiff.

COUNT III DEFENDANT VIOLATED § 1692e OF THE FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

- 29. Section 1692e of the FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from using false, deceptive or misleading representation or means in connection with the collection of any debt.
- 30. Defendant violated § 1692e of the FDCPA, when it misrepresented that it needed to speak with Plaintiff about an "important personal matter", and when it made other misrepresentations in connection to the collection of an alleged debt from Plaintiff.

COUNT IV DEFENDANT VIOLATED § 1692e(10) OF THE FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

31. Section 1692e(10) of the FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from using false representations or deceptive means to collect a debt or to obtain information

3

4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

24

23

25

26

27

28

32.

from a consumer.

Defendant violated §

1692e(10) of the FDCPA, when it

misrepresented that it needed to speak with Plaintiff about an "important personal

matter" and when it used other deceptive means to collect a debt from Plaintiff.

COUNT V **DEFENDANT VIOLATED § 1692f OF THE** FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

- 33. Section 1692f of the FDCPA prohibits debt collectors from using unfair or unconscionable means to collect or attempt to collect an alleged debt.
- 34. Defendant violated § 1692f of the FDCPA when it called Plaintiff repeatedly and continuously, when it misrepresented that it needed to speak with plaintiff about an important personal matter, and when it engaged in other unfair conduct.

COUNT VI DEFENDANT VIOLATED THE ROSENTHAL FAIR DEBT COLLECTION PRACTICES ACT

- 35. Section 1788.17 of the California Civil Code mandates that every debt collector attempting to collect a consumer debt shall comply with § 1692b through § 1692j of the FDCPA.
- Defendant violated Cal. Civ. Code § 1788.17, when it violated the FDCPA for the reasons set forth in this Complaint.

1	
2	
3	WHEREFORE, Plaintiff, ANGELA JOHNSON, respectfully prays for a
4	judgment as follows:
5	a. Actual Damages;
6	b. Statutory damages under the FDCPA and RFDCPA;
7	c. Reasonable attorney's fees and costs; and
8	d. Any other relief deemed appropriate by this Honorable Court.
9	
10	DEMAND FOR JURY TRIAL
11	
12	PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiff, ANGELA JOHNSON demands a
13	jury trial in this case.
14	
15	
16	RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,
17	
18	DATED: 5/9/2012 KIMMEL & SILVERMAN, P.C
19	By:
20	Amy L.)Bennecoff (275805)
22	Kimmel & Silverman, P.C 30 East Butler Pike
23	Ambler, PA 19002
24	Telephone: (215) 540-8888 Facsimile: (215) 540-8817
25	Email: <u>abennecoff@creditlaw.com</u> Attorney for Plaintiff
26	Attorney for Frantisis
27	
28	

Case 2:12-cv-04261-AJW Document 1 Filed 05/16/12 Page 8 of 13 Page ID #:21 |

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

NOTICE OF ASSIGNMENT TO UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE FOR DISCOVERY

This case has been assigned to District Judge Philip S. Gutierrez and the assigned discovery Magistrate Judgé is Andrew J. Wistrich.

The case number on all documents filed with the Court should read as follows:

CV12- 4261 PSG (AJWx)

Pursuant to General Order 05-07 of the United States District Court for the Central District of California, the Magistrate Judge has been designated to hear discovery related motions.

All discovery related motions should be noticed on the calendar of the Magistrate Judge

NOTICE TO COUNSEL

A copy of this notice must be served with the summons and complaint on all defendants (if a removal action is filed, a copy of this notice must be served on all plaintiffs).

Subsequent documents must be filed at the following location:

[X]	Western Division				
	312 N. Spring St., Rm. G-8				
	Los Angeles, CA 90012				

Southern Division 411 West Fourth St., Rm. 1-053 Santa Ana, CA 92701-4516 Eastern Division
3470 Twelfth St., Rm. 134
Riverside, CA 92501

Failure to file at the proper location will result in your documents being returned to you.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Central District of California

ANGELA JOHNSON	3 CV12-4261-PS (ADWX)
Plaintiff	CVIZ-4201 PS C (1000)
v. PORTFOLIO RECOVERY ASSOCIATES, LLC	Civil Action No.
Defendant	

SUMMONS IN A CIVIL ACTION

To: (Defendant's name and address) PORTFOLIO RECOVERY ASSOCIATES, LLC 140 Corporate Blvd.
Norfolk, VA 23502

A lawsuit has been filed against you.

Within 21 days after service of this summons on you (not counting the day you received it) — or 60 days if you are the United States or a United States agency, or an officer or employee of the United States described in Fed. R. Civ. P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must serve on the plaintiff an answer to the attached complaint or a motion under Rule 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The answer or motion must be served on the plaintiff or plaintiff's attorney, whose name and address are: Amy I. Bennecoff Esquire

Amy L. Bennecoff, Esquire KIMMEL & SILVERMAN 30 East Butler Pike Ambler, PA 19002 (215)540-8888

If you fail to respond, judgment by default will be entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint. You also must file your answer or motion with the court.

Date: 5-16-12

Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk

AO 440 (Rev. 12/09) Summons in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (1))

designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of (name of organization) on (date) ; or	This summons for (n	ame of individual and title, if any)		
on (date) ; or 1 left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with (name)	eceived by me on (date)			
□ I left the summons at the individual's residence or usual place of abode with (name)	☐ I personally serve	ed the summons on the individual a	Constitution of the consti	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
			on (date)	; or
on (date), and mailed a copy to the individual's last known address; or	☐ I left the summor	as at the individual's residence or us	sual place of abode with (name)	
I served the summons on (name of individual) , who designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of (name of organization) on (date); or I returned the summons unexecuted because; Other (specify): My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$ 0.00 I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true. Server's signature Printed name and title		, a person o	f suitable age and discretion who resid	des there,
designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of (name of organization) on (date) ; or returned the summons unexecuted because ; Other (specify): My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$ 0.00 I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true. Server's signature Printed name and title	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to the	he individual's last known address; or	
designated by law to accept service of process on behalf of (name of organization) on (date) ; or I returned the summons unexecuted because ; Other (specify): My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$	☐ I served the sumr	nons on (name of individual)		, who is
I returned the summons unexecuted because ; Other (specify): My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$	designated by law to	accept service of process on behal		
Treturned the summons unexecuted because ; Other (specify): My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$			on (date)	; or
Other (specify): My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$ 0.00 I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true. Server's signature Printed name and title				
My fees are \$ for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$		W		
I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true. Server's signature Printed name and title	Giffer (specify).			
I declare under penalty of perjury that this information is true. Server's signature Printed name and title				
Server's signature Printed name and title	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00
Server's signature Printed name and title				
Server's signature Printed name and title	I declare under pena	lty of perjury that this information	is true.	
Server's signature Printed name and title				
Printed name and title			Server's signature	
			22.11.2.2.8.11.11.1	
		*	Printed name and title	
Server's address				
Server's address				

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

Case 2:12-cv-04261-AJW Document 1 Filed 05/16/12 Page 12 of 13 Page ID #:25

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CIVIL COVER SHEET

I (a) PLAINTIFFS (Check box if you are representing yourself □) ANGELA JOHNSON	DEFENDANTS PORTFOLIO RECOVERY ASSOCIATES						
(b) Attorneys (Firm Name, Address and Telephone Number. If you are yourself, provide same.) AMY L. BENNECOFF, ESQ., KIMMEL & SILVERMAN, P.C. 30 East Butler Avenue, Ambler, PA 19003 (215)540-8888; abennecoff@creditlaw.com	representing A	Attorneys (If Known)					
II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an X in one box only.)		IP OF PRINCIPAL PART n one box for plaintiff and o			Only		
□ 1 U.S. Government Plaintiff	Citizen of This Sta	PTF DEF PTF I			DEF □ 4		
☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendant ☐ 4 Diversity (Indicate Citizenship of Parties in Item III)	Citizen of Another	Citizen of Another State				□ 5	
	Citizen or Subject	of a Foreign Country 🗆 3	□ 3	Foreign Nation		□6	□6
IV. ORIGIN (Place an X in one box only.)							
☐ 1 Original Proceeding State Court Appellate Court Reopened Reopened State Court Appellate Court Reopened From another district (specify): ☐ 6 Multiplication District Under State Court Reopened From another district (specify): ☐ 6 Multiplication District Under State Court District Under Magistrate Judge							
V. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT: JURY DEMAND: ✓ Yes □	No (Check 'Yes' o	only if demanded in complain	nt.)				
CLASS ACTION under F.R.C.P. 23: ☐ Yes Mo	□мо	ONEY DEMANDED IN C	OMPLA	INT: \$			
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you a 15 U.S.C. 1692k	are filing and write	a brief statement of cause. I	Oo not ci	te jurisdictional sta	atutes unless div	ersity.)	
VII. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an X in one box only.)			···· ··· ·				
	Top may 15 ship 191	TO DOTO	95000050	in racument in the	TITOUR SERVICE	0.5	No.
□ 410 Antitrust □ 120 Marine □ 310 □ 430 Banks and Banking □ 130 Miller Act □ 315 □ 450 Commerce/ICC Rates/etc. □ 140 Negotiable Instrument □ 320 □ 460 Deportation □ 150 Recovery of □ 320 □ 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations □ 151 Medicare Act □ 330 □ 480 Consumer Credit □ 152 Recovery of Defaulted □ 340 □ 490 Cable/Sat TV □ 152 Recovery of Defaulted □ 340 □ 810 Selective Service □ 152 Recovery of Defaulted □ 340 □ 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange □ 153 Recovery of Defaulted □ 340 □ 875 Customer Challenge 12 USC 3410 □ 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits □ 355 □ 890 Other Statutory Actions □ 160 Stockholders' Suits □ 360 □ 891 Agricultural Act □ 195 Contract Product □ 365 □ 892 Economic Stabilization Act □ 195 Contract Product □ 365 □ 893 Environmental Matters □ 894 Energy Allocation Act □ 196 Franchise □ 368 □ 895 Freedom of Info. Act □ 220 Foreclosure □ 368 □ 900 Appeal of Fee Determination Under Equal Acc	TORTS SONAL INJURY Airplane Airplane Product Liability Assault, Libel & Slander Fed. Employers' Liability Marine Marine Product Liability Motor Vehicle Motor Vehicle Product Liability Other Personal Injury Personal Injury Med Malpractice Personal Injury Med Malpractice Personal Injury Med Malpractice Liability Asbestos Personal Injury Product Liability AMIGRATION Naturalization Application Habeas Corpus Alien Detainee Other Immigration Actions	□ 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 □ 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 CIVIL RIGHTS □ 441 Voting □ 442 Employment □ 443 Housing/Accommodations □ 444 Welfare □ 445 American with Disabilities - Employment □ 446 American with Disabilities - Other □ 440 Other Civil Rights	510 510 510 510 530 535 540 555 FO 620 625 630 640 650 660 660	Death Penalty Mandamus/ Other Civil Rights Prison Condition RFEITURE / PENALTY Agriculture Other Food & Drug Drug Related Seizure of Property 21 USC 881 Liquor Laws R.R. & Truck Airline Regs Occupational Safety /Health	CAE 710 Fair La Act	Mgmt. ns Mgmt. ns Mgmt. ng & ure Acic y Labooi on Ret. Inc y Act Y RIGH ghts ark ark GCURI 395ff) ung (9 DIWW) ittle XV (5(g))	t Act TY 23) TI JITS aintiff
FOR OFFICE USE ONLY: Case Number: AFTER COMPLETING THE FRONT SIDE OF	PODM CV #1 C	OMDITED THE TAKE AND CO.	TATE OF	Theories are	OFI OW		***************************************

CV-71 (05/08) CIVIL COVER SHEET Page 1 of 2

Case 2:12-cv-04261-AJW Document 1 Filed 05/16/12 Page 13 of 13 Page ID #:26

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CIVIL COVER SHEET

VIII(a). IDENTICAL CASES: Has If yes, list case number(s):	this action been pre	viously filed in this court an	d dismissed, remanded or closed? ▼No □ Yes				
VIII(b). RELATED CASES: Have If yes, list case number(s):		viously filed in this court that	t are related to the present case? V No 🗆 Yes				
(Check all boxes that apply) \square A. \square B. \square C. \square	Civil cases are deemed related if a previously filed case and the present case: (Check all boxes that apply) A. Arise from the same or closely related transactions, happenings, or events; or B. Call for determination of the same or substantially related or similar questions of law and fact; or C. For other reasons would entail substantial duplication of labor if heard by different judges; or D. Involve the same patent, trademark or copyright, and one of the factors identified above in a, b or c also is present.						
IX. VENUE: (When completing the	following information	on, use an additional sheet if	necessary.)				
			f other than California; or Foreign Country, in which EACH named plaintiff resides. this box is checked, go to item (b).				
County in this District:*			California County outside of this District; State, if other than California; or Foreign Country				
Ventura County							
			f other than California; or Foreign Country, in which EACH named defendant resides. If this box is checked, go to item (c).				
County in this District:*			California County outside of this District; State, if other than California; or Foreign Country				
			Norfolk, VA				
(c) List the County in this District; (County in this District; County			f other than California; or Foreign Country, in which EACH claim arose.				
County in this District:*			California County outside of this District; State, if other than California; or Foreign Country				
Ventura County		·					
* Los Angeles, Orange, San Bernar Note: In land condemnation cases, us	dino, Riverside, Ve	ntura, Santa Barbara, or S tract of land involved	jan Luis Obispo Counties				
X. SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY (XOR!	Date 05/09/2012				
or other papers as required by law	 This form, approve 	ed by the Judicial Conference	mation contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings of the United States in September 1974, is required pursuant to Local Rule 3-1 is not filed ing the civil docket sheet. (For more detailed instructions, see separate instructions sheet.)				
Key to Statistical codes relating to So	cial Security Cases:						
Nature of Suit Code	Abbreviation	Substantive Statement of	f Cause of Action				
861	HIA	All claims for health insurance benefits (Medicare) under Title 18, Part A, of the Social Security Act, as amended. Also, include claims by hospitals, skilled nursing facilities, etc., for certification as providers of services under the program. (42 U.S.C. 1935FF(b))					
862	BL	All claims for "Black Lung" benefits under Title 4, Part B, of the Federal Coal Mine Health and Safety Act of 1969. (30 U.S.C. 923)					
863	DIWC	All claims filed by insured workers for disability insurance benefits under Title 2 of the Social Security Act, as amended; plus all claims filed for child's insurance benefits based on disability. (42 U.S.C. 405(g))					
863	DIWW All claims filed for widows or widowers insurance benefits based on disability under Title 2 of the Social Security Act, as amended. (42 U.S.C. 405(g))						
864	SSID	All claims for supplementa Act, as amended.	al security income payments based upon disability filed under Title 16 of the Social Security				
865	RSI	All claims for retirement (old age) and survivors benefits under Title 2 of the Social Security Act, as amended. (42 U.S.C. (g))					

CV-71 (05/08) CIVIL COVER SHEET Page 2 of 2